# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KARNATAKA AT BENGALURU DATED THIS THE $11^{TH}$ DAY OF JANUARY, 2024 PRESENT

THE HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE P.S. DINESH KUMAR

AND

THE HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE T.G. SHIVASHANKARE GOWDA

# WRIT PETITION NO. 22695 OF 2023 (EDN-RES)

## **BETWEEN:**

- 1. ANIKETH S. PHOOLBHAVI S/O SANJAYKUMAR PHOOLBHAVI AGED ABOUT 22 YEARS REG NO.21M8298
- 2. SUBRAMANYA .G.K S/O KOTRESH .G AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21M8409
- 3. MANOJ .C.R S/O RAMESHA .C.T AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21M8342
- 4. SUBRAMANYA UMESH BENCHANAMARDI S/O UMESH NAGAPPA BENCHANAMARDI AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21MB8410
- 5. RIFAQUAT TAMMIM MOHAMMED ILIYAS PATHAN S/O M.A. PATHAN AGED ABOUT 20 YEARS REG NO.21M8380.

- 6. PEERZADE MOINUDDIN SHARFODDIN S/O SHARFODDIN PEERZADE AGED ABOUT 20 YEARS REG NO.21M8364
- 7. BIYA BIJU
  D/O BIJU KURIAN
  AGED ABOUT 22 YEARS
  REG NO.21M8314
- 8. KHUSHI .M
  D/O H. MANJUNATH
  AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS
  REG NO.21M8329
- 9. POOJITHA J. ANGADI D/O JEETENDRA ANGADI AGED ABOUT 20 YEARS REG NO.21M8366
- 10. SPOORTI K. VASTRAD
  D/O KUMARASWAMI VASTRAD
  AGED ABOUT 20 YEARS
  REG NO.21M8408
- 11. SONIYA S. GAWAS
  D/O SANTHOSH GAWAS
  AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS
  REG NO.21M8403
- 12. ADILA SADAF D/O AFSAR PASHA AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21M8286
- 13. TUSHAR RAKESH BHASME S/O RAKESH BHASME AGED ABOUT 22 YEARS REG NO.21M8421
- 14. NAYEEMUNNISA KHAZI D/O ABDUL SUBHAN KHAZI

AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21M8352

- 15. VISHNU .D.S S/O D.S. SURESH AGED ABOUT 22 YEARS REG NO.21M8432
- 16. MOHAMMED ZAID S/O MAHABOOB BASHA AGED ABOUT 21 YEARS REG NO.21M8346
- 17. ARGHO ROY S/O MOHIT ROY AGED ABOUT 24 YEARS REG NO.21M8435
- 18. SAURABH BHOSALE S/O DATTATRAY AGED ABOUT 26 YEARS REG NO.21M8312

ALL PETITIONERS ARE 2<sup>ND</sup> YEAR MBBS STUDENTS G.R. MEDICAL COLLEGE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PADU, VIA PADUMALE NEERUMARGA MANGALORE-575 029.

...PETITIONERS

(BY SHRI. CHANDRAKANTH R. GOULAY, ADVOCATE)

### AND:

- 1. THE UNION OF INDIA
  REP BY SECRETARY
  MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES
  NIRMAN BHAVAN, MOULANA AZAD ROAD
  NEW DELHI-110 011.
- 2. NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION (ERSTWHILE MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA) POCKET 14, SECTOR-8

DWARKA, NEW DELHI-110 007. REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY.

- 3. MEDICAL ASSESSMENT AND RATING BOARD (MARB)
  UNDER GRADUATE SECTION NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION POCKET-14, SECTOR 8
  DWARKA, PHASE I
  NEW DELHI-110 077.
- 4. STATE OF KARNATAKA
  DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
  AND FAMILY WELFARE
  105, 1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR
  SECRETARIAT BUILDING
  VIKASA SOUDHA, SESHADRI ROAD
  BENGALURU-560 001.
  REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY.
- 5. THE DIRECTORATE OF MEDICAL EDUCATION REPRESENTED BY ITS DIRECTOR I FLOOR, FORT, K.R.ROAD BENGALURU-560 002.
- 6. KARNATAKA EXAMINATIONS AUTHORITY SAMPIGE ROAD, 18<sup>TH</sup> CROSS MALLESHWARAM BANGALORE-560 012.
  REPRESENTED BY ITS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
- 7. RAJIV GANDHI UNIVERSITY OF HEALTH SCIENCES 4<sup>TH</sup> T BLOCK, JAYANAGAR BANGALORE-560 041. REPRESENTED BY ITS REGISTRAR
- 8. G R MEDICAL COLLEGE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PADU, VIA PADUMALE NEERUMARGA MANGALORE-575 029. REPRESENTED BY ITS PRINCIPAL

9. G R EDUCATION TRUST
NEERMARGA, NEER MARGA
MANGALORE-575 029.
REPRESENTED BY ITS
AUTHORISED OFFICER

...RESPONDENTS

(BY SHRI. S. RAJASHEKAR, CGC FOR R1;

SHRI. N. KHETTY, ADVOCATE FOR R2 AND R3;

SHRI. SUDEV HEGDE, AGA FOR R4 AND R5;

SHRI. N.K. RAMESH, ADVOCATE FOR R6;

SMT. FARAH FATHIMA, ADVOCATE FOR R7;

SHRI. D.R. RAVI SHANKAR, SENIOR ADVOCATE FOR

SHRI. S.A. SUDHINDRA, ADVOCATE FOR R8 AND R9)

THIS WRIT PETITION IS FILED UNDER ARTICLES 226 AND 227 OF THE CONSTITUTION OF INDIA PRAYING TO ISSUE A DIRECTIONS TO THE RESPONDENTS 1 TO 7 CONSIDER/EXTEND THE BENEFIT OF ALLOTMENT/TRANSFER FROM RESPONDENT No. 8 COLLEGE TO ANY OTHER RECOGNISED COLLEGE IN THE STATE (24 COLLEGES) RECOGNIZED AND UNDER THE CONTROL OF RGHUS-RESPONDENT No. 7 BY COUNSELING ON THE BASIS OF THEIR RESPECTIVE NEET RANKINGS AND IN THEIR RESPECTIVE QUOTA AND TO PASS APPROPRIATE SUITABLE ORDERS IN THE INTEREST OF JUSTICE AND EQUITY.

THIS WRIT PETITION, HAVING BEEN HEARD AND RESERVED FOR ORDERS ON 09.11.2023, COMING ON FOR PRONOUNCEMENT OF ORDERS THIS DAY, **P.S. DINESH KUMAR, J.**, PRONOUNCED THE FOLLOWING:-

### **ORDER**

This writ petition has been filed by students admitted to the I year MBBS Course in the academic year 2021-22 with a prayer *inter alia* to transfer them to any other Medical College in Karnataka, to continue their studies for the academic year 2022-23 and subsequent years, because, NMC<sup>1</sup> has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> National Medical Commission

disapproved the renewal of GR Medical College for the academic year 2022-23.

- 2. Heard Shri. Chandrakanth Goulay, learned Advocate for the petitioners, Shri. S. Rajashekhar, learned CGC for the UOI<sup>2</sup>; Shri. N. Khetty, Standing Counsel for NMC<sup>3</sup> and Medical Assessment and Rating Board: Shri. Sudev Hegde, learned AGA for the State; Shri. N.K. Ramesh, learned Advocate for the KEA<sup>4</sup>; Smt. Farah RGHUS<sup>5</sup>; Advocate for Fathima, learned and Ravishankar, learned Senior Advocate Shri. D.R. G.R. Medical College.
- 3. We have simultaneously considered two writ petitions<sup>6</sup> filed by G R Medical College Hospital and Research Centre, Mangaluru. While considering the said writ petitions, we have framed the following question:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Union of India

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> National Medical Commission

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Karnataka Examination Authority

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Science

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> W.P. Nos. 17254/2023 & 22397/2023

Whether the order transferring the students to different colleges calls for any interference?

and answered the same in the negative, thereby, upholding the State Government's move to transfer the students to different Colleges.

4. Hence, for reasons recorded in the common order in W.P. Nos. 17254/2023 & 22397/2023 this writ petition must succeed. Hence, the following:

# **ORDER**

- *i.* Writ petition is **allowed**.
- ii. State Government shall transfer the petitioners to any other recognized College and approve their permanent transfer to the respective Colleges.

No costs.

Sd/-JUDGE

Sd/-JUDGE